AN ANALYSIS OF PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT SYSTEM FOR IMPROVING LOCAL GOVERNMENT

Lilis Sri Sulistiani [ab*)], Kismartini [b)], Sri Suwitri [b)], Ika Riswanti Putranti[b)]

[a)]*Universitas Jenderal Soedirman, Banyumas, Indonesia*
[b)]*Universitas Diponegoro, Semarang, Indonesia*

[*)]*Corresponding Author: lilissfz@gmail.com*

Abstract. This paper will look at the success of a local government organization with the determination of organizational resources and the right performance management system in order to improve public services in the local government. This article aimed at finding out whether the performance management system is appropriate if it is implemented in the local government work environment. The research method used a literature study by analyzing previous research and other various reference sources, both from textbooks, national journals, and reputable international journals. As an analytical material, we provided an example of an analysis of the performance management system in Banyumas Regency Government. Based on this, it can be concluded that Banyumas Regency always strives to improve organizational performance and existing resources through the implementation of performance management practices although formally the Head of the Region has not yet established a performance management system that applies in Banyumas Regency

Keywords: performance management; local government; organization

I. INTRODUCTION

The success of the organization in achieving the goals that have been set depends on the quality of the resources it has [1]. Therefore, every organization must have the ability to manage its resources, both human resources and other resources. Human resource management is important for the continuity of the organization [2]. This is so because humans are the main movers who can manage other resources in every organization. One of the important things that must be executed to get the best performance from human resources is through performance management. The performance management can be described as policies, strategies, and techniques intended to direct the attention of managers and employees towards improving organizational performance [3]

Performance management is the process of designing and implementing strategies, motivating, intervening, and directing goals to turn human potential into performance. However, the utilization and conversion of potential into performance is often less than optimal for various reasons. Therefore, the role of performance management acts as an agent in converting potential into performance by removing obstacles and motivating and rejuvenating human resources as well as possible [4].

The Government of Indonesia introduces techniques, measurement systems, and performance management for the central government and local governments. Through Presidential Instruction No. 7/1999 on Performance Accountability of Government Agencies, government agencies are required to submit performance accountability reports. Subsequently, in 2007, the Ministry for Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform (KemenPAN RB) issued Regulation No. 9/2007 on general guidelines for determining Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) in Government Agencies which are required for the use of results/results-based indicators in performance accountability reports. Regulations require local governments to develop results-based indicators at the local government level and at the departmental level.

Performance management practices have been applied mainly at the level of ministries and government agencies. Regulations as a formal legal basis are partially set in several ministries. The search results from one of the ministries that stipulate performance management in the regulation is the Ministry of Home Affairs through Permendagri No. 16 of 2014 on Performance Management System within the Ministry of Home Affairs. Article 1 paragraph (1) states that "The Performance Management System is the utilization of resources and information to achieve organizational goals through the organization of strategic maps, the organization of Key Performance Indicators (KPIs), the performance monitoring and evaluation, and the performance report in stages." The paragraph implies that performance management consists of 4 aspects, namely the organization of strategic maps, the organization of Key Performance Indicators (KPIs), the performance monitoring and evaluation, and the performance report.

Performance management system is required especially by government organizations in developing countries where the role of the central government still

dominates. One of the characteristics is the presence of a centralized decision-making apparatus, which distances power from the people. Centralized decision-making reduces accountability between public sector officials. The presence of a performance management system is a good rule for unwanted decisions and mismanagement of performance and resources at the expense of the quality of public services [5]. Theoretically, the performance management system is a different concept from performance appraisal. Armstrong and Baron stated that performance management has a wider and comprehensive reach because it involves organizational factors such as organizational planning, unit planning, individual performance appraisals, performance rewards, and competencies [6], [7]. Meanwhile, performance appraisal involves more employees and managers in its implementation.

II. RESEARCH METHODS

In this article, the authors used a library research approach [8]. Literature research is a form of secondary research conducted by identifying, evaluating, and interpreting research findings related to certain topics or phenomena. The steps of library research were carried out using a systematic review approach, which means that it begins with identifying research problems, limiting the search for relevant research findings, collecting relevant research findings, and selecting and extracting search results based on data using research topics and metaphysics.

To answer research questions, the materials used in library research were from books, previous research reviews, and archives/documents with the same level of relevance as the topic of this article. The journals used were obtained from well-known international journals and nationally recognized journals that discuss research topics on regional government performance management. More than 18 journals and some literature, were used as reference frameworks and theories when analyzing problems related to research topics. The data used were secondary data that were supported by similar research. Secondary data were obtained from government documents such as performance reports, bibliographic data, statistics, regulations, and legal data and can be analyzed as research sources.

The most important point analyzed in this study was how to implement the performance management in the local government of Banyumas Regency in order to improve public services. An analysis of library data was carried out using a meta-synthetic analysis method with a meta-aggregation approach [9]. Meta-synthesis was carried out by summarizing the results of previous studies that are in accordance with the research theme with narrative techniques after the selection and extraction process for the search results. The results of the research summary were then approached using meta-aggregation to aggregate (descriptive) in accordance with the research theory framework and the points to be analyzed to answer research questions.

III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Previous Researches

Previous researches have examined the problem of performance management system implemented in various organizations with various characteristics. Each research has advantages and limitations in the dimensions studied, but it provides a lot of information and studies that can add references to future research. Research on performance management has been carried out with many different focuses and using different research designs. In quantitative research, performance management is placed as a variable that is influenced or affects other variables. Meanwhile, qualitative research emphasizes the implementation of performance management and the stages of implementing a performance management system.

John Isaac Mwita suggested that the quality of public sector management in the countries whic are developing lag behind that of developing countries due to the disease of excessive centralization [5]. The delivery of public services in developing countries is highly centralized. One of the characteristics is the presence of a centralized decision-making apparatus, which distances power from the people. Centralized decision-making reduces accountability between public sector apparatus and is a good rule for unwanted decisions and mismanagement of performance and resources at the expense of the quality of public services. Therefore, public services in developing countries drain some of their economic wealth outcomes.

This literature review was based on the theoretical framework of performance management (PM) as a system model based on "achievement culture" in public sector organizations. The use of various practical econometric and managerial techniques can integrate performance management models in an effort to realize the advantages of the new public management philosophy. This study concludes by looking at the "new" role of management accounting systems in meeting the 'information needs' of modern public sector managers, as a potential direction for further research. This study proposes that the adoption of performance management models is a universal remedy for higher-quality public services in developing countries.

Frayer and Anthoni conducted research using the literature review method, finding that improvements in performance, transparency, service quality, and value for money have not materialized in the public sector [10]. There are three types of problems in performance management in the public sector, namely technical, system and engagement. Externally restructuring and reorganization limit the successful implementation of performance management. This research focused more on three problems that are known to affect the implementation of performance management. In further discussion, Frayer and Anthoni stated that technical problems were related to indicators and data collected, interpretation, and data analysis. Meanwhile, the system problem refers to a bigger picture problem, namely integrating performance systems with the systems currently in use, lack of strategic focus that encourages

short-term achievement, ambiguous performance goals, and optimization of performance management costs. The third problem includes the dominance of soft problems and their involvement in the performance management system, interpretation between various stakeholders, lack of customer involvement, and lack of involvement of the entire organization including adequate support from higher levels of management and decision making.

Research conducted by Rodney McAdam discussed the implementation of a new performance management system applied to a company [11]. Using a quantitative method, with 700 respondents, the instrument is a short questionnaire to determine perceptions about the implementation and effectiveness of the new performance management system. The results showed that staff at all levels had an understanding of the new system and found it useful. However, there were concerns that if this approach was not managed professionally throughout the year, it would become an annual event, not an ongoing process. Furthermore, the change process seemed to have advanced, but change was not compatible with the assessment and reward and recognition system. Thus, there was a mismatch between business goals and motivational factors in the organization. The implication of Mc Adam's research results was that performance management needed to be managed so that it became a continuous process and gave benefits for staff. Furthermore, the success of performance management was also supported by an assessment and reward system which is an important part of the performance management system.

Jisoo Ock and Frederick Oswald stated that research using this quantitative method assumes that accurate performance appraisal (PA) is an important prerequisite for an effective performance management system (PM), because by using accurate performance appraisal information, management, teams, and employees can be involved in the process of identifying and developing various job-relevant knowledge or skills to improve job performance [12]. The focus on interpersonal aspects of performance management include (a) Interpersonal dynamics, (b) Organizational social context, and (c) Environmental creation for open communication. This research from Jisoo Ock provides confirmation that when talking about a performance management system, it will definitely involve a performance appraisal because these systems cannot be separated from one another. This means that the success of a performance management system cannot be separated from the implementation of a performance appraisal system. However, performance appraisal cannot stand alone and must always be integrated with performance management.

The next research was conducted by Jhon Wahyudi using a qualitative research design [13]. It aimed at answering various problems regarding the response of Civil Servants in the Government of Barito Timur Regency to the enactment of Government Regulation No. 46 of 2011 on Performance Assessment of Civil Servants. This research found that the performance appraisal should be improved according to the demands, and should begin with perfecting

information about the duties and functions of the position. Meanwhile, in terms of organization, the government must regulate work rules and could change the mindset and work culture. The results of Jhon Wahyudi's research have implications that performance appraisal cannot function perfectly without being supported by the clarity of main tasks and functions according to the position held by the employee. Thus, each employee has a main task and function that must be done to achieve certain targets.

The findings of this research showed that the current performance management system (RBM) did not help to improve service quality in the civil service. Performance management was intended to improve individual, team, and organizational performance. In this research, it was observed that the current system was not understood by most of the employees even after receiving the training. This is due to the very complex implemented system.

Sutheewasinnon et al. presented in their paper on the analysis of this 'new' performance management system developed by the Government of Thailand [14]. The research method used was qualitative to analyze and collect empirical data. Data were collected through two primary data, namely document archives and interviews. Our main source of empirical data archives was internal organizational document data. The second main source of data included a series of interviews with four executives in two departments involved with the decision and development of a performance agreement framework for Thai government agencies.

First, it showed how the different phases of performance management system development influenced by different institutional pressures interacted to bring about change. Second, this research illuminated the discursive and non-discursive strategies employed by agents in a highly institutionalized environment in order to develop systems and gain legitimacy for them. This research complemented the recent importance of neo-institutional theory for understanding how agents emerge from their country embedded to contribute to institutional change.

There are four stages associated with the development of performance management system in Thailand, and these four stages receive different isomorphic pressures according to each stage. These stages are as follows:

1. Stage one: the development of results-based management system, the role of donor agencies and entrepreneurs is rather lazy. This stage is marked by the joint of a number of institutional forces: the international lending institutions, the public sector of Western countries, an entrepreneur, and the office of a civil service commission. This stage also reveals the strategies used by these entrepreneurs to try and influence government departments to adopt a performance agreement framework.

2. The second stage is the establishment of a public sector development commission office and the emergence of effective entrepreneurs. Our analysis phase shows how the government decided that in order to realize the

effective development of the new performance management system, an effective entrepreneur is needed and established his position in the law. The main isomorphic pressure at this point comes from institutional entrepreneurs and coercive legal forces.

3. The third stage, the development of a performance agreement framework. This section reveals the efforts by institutional entrepreneurs to improve and expand the results-based management system developed in the first stage which is based on the Balanced Scorecard. However, we see that this framework is becoming too complex and difficult for the Thai public sector to understand and use. The framework consists of four perspectives. Specific indicators of performance.

4. The fourth stage includes refining and expanding the framework of the performance agreement. This stage is marked by the joint of two main isomorphic pressures, namely, employers' organizations continuing to develop and perfecting performance systems and mimetic pressures leading to the integration of the Malcolm Baldrige National Quality Award with the Performance Agreement Framework. The application of this reward system allows agents of the performance agreement framework to multiply by mobilizing individual employees to engage in self-assessment. We suggest that engagement is one way of building institutions.

Studies conducted by Andre A. De Waal showed that many organizations implemented performance management system, based on critical success factors, key performance indicators, and balanced scorecards, to improve their results [15]. In practice, many organizations had difficulty implementing performance management system because the influence of behavioral factors and national culture was not taken into account. This article describes research findings on the role of national behavior and culture in establishing an effective performance management system in multinationals. The factors that influence this behavior are: structural factors that affect the structure and content of the performance management system; behavioral factors that influence the use of the management system by people in the organization; systems related to performance management such as evaluation and reward systems; and cultural factors (both organizational and national).

Government Performance Management System in Banyumas Regency

In line with the concept put forward [6] Banyumas Regency as a local government always strives to improve organizational and employee performance through performance management practices. Although formally the Regent does not establish a performance management system that applies to local governments, as part of the government and the State of Indonesia, it is obligatory to comply with the laws and regulations above.

Performance management in Banyumas Regency begins with the preparation of a strategic map that is embodied in a development planning document. Based on Law Number 25 of 2004 on the National Development Planning System, Article 3 states that national development planning includes the administration of government at a macro level, covering all areas of life, integrated within the territory of the State of Indonesia. Therefore, in formulating the vision and mission in regional development planning, it must refer to and be guided by national development planning.

The compatibility of the vision and mission of the Regional Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMD) with the National Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMN) is one of the requirements in the organization of RPJMD. This is an effort to synchronize between central and regional development plans. However, in the implementation of performance management in local governments, there are various obstacles. According to a study from the PAN-RB Ministry, one of the obstacles is the inability of government agencies to set results-oriented strategic goals and targets. In line with the problems raised by the PAN-RB (Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform of the Republic of Indonesia) Ministry, Banyumas Regency encountered a similar issue. One of the functions of government institutions is as a provider of public services so that one of the benchmarks for the success of the organization is measuring the satisfaction of the community with the services provided. The average performance of the target of increasing public services with the indicator of the Community Satisfaction index reaced 3.31 from the target of 2 or reaching 165.5%. Based on the results of conversion of the calculation of the Community Satisfaction Survey in accordance with the Regulation of the the Ministry for Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform of the Republic of Indonesia Number 14 of 2017 on Guidelines for Compiling a Community Satisfaction Survey for Public Service Providers, the result was 82.71. From the value of the Community Satisfaction Survey of 82.71, the value of the community satisfaction index was 3.31 with the criteria for the value of service quality in category B (Good).

Table 1. Performance achievement of public service quality targets

No.	Performance Indicator	Unit	Year 2017			Year 2018		
			Target	Realization	%	Target	Realization	%
1	Community Satisfaction Index	Value	2	3	150	2	3.31	165.5
Average Achievement Target Performance					100			165.5

Performance is the result achieved through physical and non-physical activities. These activities are realized in services that the community can get the benefits. Performance management norms in an organization are the achievement of goals at an efficient cost. One measure of performance for government agencies is efficiency in the use of resources [16], [17]. Based on the results of the efficiency analysis of the performance report, Banyumas Regency achieved a fairly good level of efficiency in several targets, although there were still some targets that were not efficient. The following is the Table showing complete data on the

level of efficiency achievement. The complete data can be seen in Table 2.

Table 2. The Level Of Efficiency In The Use Of Resources Of Banyumas Regency Government In 2018

No.	Mission	The Number of Indicator	Performance Achievement	Effectiveness Level	Category
1.	MISSION 1	1	165.5	82.03	Quite Efficient
2.	MISSION 2	10	98.89	No Data	No Data
3.	MISSION 3	4	103.67	10.87	Very Efficient
4.	MISSION 4	2	105.22	10.27	Very Efficient
5.	MISSION 5 A	3	102.67	4.51	Very Efficient
	MISSION 5 B	3	88.82	No Data	No Data
6.	MISSION 6 A	4	119.66	29.97	Very Efficient
	MISSION 6 B	1	104.66	23.35	Very Efficient
	MISSION 6 C	2	175.08	15.76	Very Efficient
7.	MISSION 7 A	2	106.25	128.46	Not Efficient
	MISSION 7 B	2	103.60	21.09	Very Efficient
	MISSION 7 C	3	290.38	203.64	Not Efficient
	Total	37	130.37	43.69	

The data in Table 2 show the 12 targets consisting of 37 target indicators implemented during 2018, with various efficiency levels achieved. In general, the level of efficiency describes 2 conditions. First, programs, activities, functions, and activities have been managed, regulated, and organized efficiently. Second, the government has provided quality services that are oriented to the needs of the community and held at the right time [18]. But there were two missions with 13 indicators that did not have efficient level data and there were still 5 indicators that were inefficient. This raises the question, whether the absence of data can provide accurate conclusions. In addition to meeting the efficient criteria, the implementation of activities must meet the effective criteria, namely how a government agency can do the right thing and achieve the goals that have been determined.

Table 3. Budget Effectiveness On Target Achievement

No.	Mission	The Number of Indicator	Performance Achievement	Effectiveness Level	Category
1.	MISSION 1	1	165.5	82.03	Quite Efficient
2.	MISSION 2	10	98.89	No Data	No Data
3.	MISSION 3	4	103.67	10.87	Very Efficient
4.	MISSION 4	2	105.22	10.27	Very Efficient
5.	MISSION 5 A	3	102.67	4.51	Very Efficient
	MISSION 5 B	3	88.82	No Data	No Data
6.	MISSION 6 A	4	119.66	29.97	Very Efficient
	MISSION 6 B	1	104.66	23.35	Very Efficient
	MISSION 6 C	2	175.08	15.76	Very Efficient
7.	MISSION 7 A	2	106.25	128.46	Not Efficient
	MISSION 7 B	2	103.60	21.09	Very Efficient
	MISSION 7 C	3	290.38	203.64	Not Efficient
	Total	37	130.37	43.69	

The data in Table 3 show the level of effectiveness in the implementation of activities managed by the Banyumas Regency government. Of the 37 targets set, 10 targets reach the effective category, while 12 targets are still classified as less effective. This reflects that the achievement of the goals that have been set is still less than optimal. The development of the theme of performance management is still an interesting topic of discussion and getting attention from academics and human resource management professionals. The direction of performance management research is divided into several groups of perspectives, according to their respective knowledge and experience. Some researchers describe performance management as a broader system in which performance appraisal is only one element of performance management [19], [20]. This view sees performance appraisal as an annual evaluation practice; while performance management is sustainable.

Several experts have provided different views and definitions of performance management practices. [21], [22] defined performance management as combining performance appraisal practices with elements of performance management. The study conducted by Tan concluded that the performance management model that grows and develops in the private sector cannot be directly adopted by government organizations [23]. The first difficulty in implementing performance management relates to the characteristics of public organizations that are not for profit. Secondly, public organizations deal with different characteristics of society from consumers. Therefore, further studies of performance management in public organizations are needed by involving more elements of appropriate measurement. Meanwhile, the study conducted by Jurnali and Nabiha indicated that the implementation of performance management has begun to be applied in Indonesia in the aspects of reporting and accountability [24]. However, the implementation of the performance management system that has been implemented has shown unsatisfactory results. The obstacles faced have encouraged local governments to implement a performance management system only as a fulfillment of formal obligations to the center.

From the various descriptions and problems that have been put forward, several problems can be identified related to performance management practices in Banyumas Regency Government, including:

1. The formal organization of development planning has followed the applicable regulations, but in determining the main performance indicators it was considered still less than optimal.
2. The achievement of the efficiency level of the implementation of activities was still not optimal, because there were still 13 targets without achievement data and 5 targets were in the ineffective category.
3. The achievement of the level of effectiveness of the implementation of activities was still less than optimal with 12 ineffective targets.

Performance management studies in public organizations are still needed in order to find a system that fits the characteristics of public organizations.

IV. CONCLUSION

Banyumas Regency always strives to improve organizational performance and existing resources through the implementation of performance management practices even though formally the Head of the Region head has not yet established a performance management system that applies in Banyumas Regency. The existence of a strategic map of the government pattern in macro can help the implementation of the development of performance management in Banyumas Regency. Of course, this is directly related to how the services are provided by government resources in Banyumas Regency. In general, conditions in Banyumas Regency describe two conditions. First, programs, activities, functions and activities have been managed, regulated, and organized efficiently. Second, the government has provided quality services that are oriented to the needs of the community and carried out at the right time. In terms of the level of effectiveness of the implementation of activities managed by the government of Banyumas Regency from 37 targets set, there were 10 targets that reach the effective category, while 12 targets were still classified as less effective. This reflects that the achievement of the goals that have been set was still not optimal.

REFERENCES

[1] M. Tovey, M.L. Uren;, and N.E.Sheldon, *Managing Performance Improvement*. Australia: Pearson, 2010.

[2] A. J. Mahardhani, S. Suwitri, S. Zauhar, and H. Purnaweni, "REGIONAL COOPERATION OF DEVELOPMENT IN LOCAL GOVERNMENT," *STED J. J. Soc. Technol. Dev.*, vol. 3, no. 1, Apr. 2021.

[3] R. Andrews, G. A. Boyne, J. Law, and R. M. Walker, "Strategic management and public service performance," *Strateg. Manag. Public Serv. Perform.*, pp. 1–212, Jan. 2011.

[4] S. R. Kandula, *Competency based human resource management*, vol. 72, no. 2. John Wiley & Sons, Ltd, 2015.

[5] J. I. Mwita, "Performance management model: A systems-based approach to public service quality," *Int. J. Public Sect. Manag.*, vol. 13, no. 1, pp. 19–37, 2000.

[6] M. Armstrong, A. Baron, and Institute of Personnel and Development., *Performance management : the new realities*. London: Institute of Personnel and Development, 1998.

[7] R. D. Stanciu, "Do Romanian Small and Medium-sized Enterprises Use Performance Management? An Empirical Study," *Procedia - Soc. Behav. Sci.*, vol. 124, pp. 255–262, Mar. 2014.

[8] A. Hamzah, *Metode Penelitian Kepustakaan (Library Reseacrh): Kajian Filosofis, Teoritis, dan Aplikatif*. Malang: Literasi Nusantara, 2019.

[9] S. Siswanto, "SYSTEMATIC REVIEW SEBAGAI METODE PENELITIAN UNTUK MENSINTESIS HASIL-HASIL PENELITIAN (SEBUAH PENGANTAR)," *Bul. Penelit. Sist. Kesehat.*, vol. 13, no. 4, 2012.

[10] K. Fryer, J. Antony, and S. Ogden, "Performance management in the public sector," *Int. J. Public Sect. Manag.*, vol. 22, no. 6, pp. 478–498, Aug. 2009.

[11] R. McAdam, "A multi-level theory of innovation implementation: Normative evaluation, legitimisation and conflict," *Eur. J. Innov. Manag.*, vol. 8, no. 3, pp. 373–388, 2005.

[12] O. J, M. ST, M. E, and O. FL, "The Practical Effects of Measurement Invariance: Gender Invariance in Two Big Five Personality Measures," *Assessment*, vol. 27, no. 4, pp. 657–674, Jun. 2020.

[13] J. Wahyudi, "Penilaian Kinerja Pegawai Negeri Sipil (Kajian Pra lmplementasi Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 46 Tahun 2011 tentang Penilaian Prestasi Kerja PNS di Lingkungan Pemerintah Kabupaten Barito Timur)," Universitas Terbuka, Jakarta, 2013.

[14] P. Sutheewasinnon, Z. Hoque, and R. O. Nyamori, "Development of a performance management system in the Thailand public sector: Isomorphism and the role and strategies of institutional entrepreneurs," *Crit. Perspect. Account.*, vol. 40, pp. 26–44, Oct. 2016.

[15] A. A. De Waal, "The Secret of High Performance Organizations," *Manag. Online Rev.*, Apr. 2008.

[16] A. Fauzi and H. N. A. Rusi, *Manajemen Kinerja*. Surabaya: Airlangga University Press, 2020.

[17] A. Sadjiarto, "AKUNTABILITAS DAN PENGUKURAN KINERJA PEMERINTAHAN ," *J. Akunt. dan Keuang.*, vol. 2, no. 2, Oct. 2000.

[18] I. N. Sutawijaya and A. Kurniawan, *Audit Kinerja, Mendorong Peningkatan Value Organisasi Pemerintah Dalam Mewujudkan World Class Government*. Yogyakarta: Andi Publisher, 2020.

[19] H. Aguinis, H. Joo, and R. K. Gottfredson, "Performance management universals: Think globally and act locally," *Bus. Horiz.*, vol. 55, no. 4, pp. 385–392, Jul. 2012.

[20] A. J. Kinicki, K. J. L. Jacobson, S. J. Peterson, and G. E. Prussia, "Development and Validation of the Performance Management Behavior Questionnaire," *Pers. Psychol.*, vol. 66, no. 1, pp. 1–45, 2013.

[21] B. J. Avolio, M. Rotundo, and F. O. Walumbwa, "Early life experiences as determinants of leadership role occupancy: The importance of parental influence and rule breaking behavior," *Leadersh. Q.*, vol. 20, no. 3, pp. 329–342, 2009.

[22] G. Latham and K. Wexley, *Latham & Wexley, Increasing Productivity through Performance Appraisal (Pearson Series in Human Resources)*, 2nd ed. United States: Pearson Education (US), 1994.

[23] B. S. Tan, "Accounting Research for the Management

Accounting Profession," *SSRN Electron. J.*, Apr. 2015.

[24] T. Jurnali and A. K. Siti-Nabiha, "Performance Management System for Local Government: The Indonesian Experience:," *Glob. Bus. Rev.*, vol. 16, no. 3, pp. 351–363, Jun. 2015.