

## SHADOW STATE ANALYSIS OF COLLABORATIVE ELITE IN PEAT RESTORATION PROGRAM MANAGEMENT

Delpi Susanti <sup>a\*</sup>, Weni Puji Hastuti <sup>a)</sup>, Dini Handayani <sup>a)</sup>, Achmad Pauzi <sup>a)</sup>, Anton Budhi Dharma <sup>a)</sup>,  
Desi Handayani <sup>a)</sup>, Sujianto <sup>a)</sup>, Yustina <sup>a)</sup>, Hasim 'Asyari <sup>a)</sup>, Harapan Tua <sup>a)</sup>, Febri Yuliani <sup>a)</sup>

<sup>a)</sup>University of Riau, Riau, Indonesia

<sup>\*</sup>Corresponding Author: [delpi.susanti7023@grad.unri.ac.id](mailto:delpi.susanti7023@grad.unri.ac.id)

Article history: received 02 September 2023; revised 16 September 2023; accepted 02 October 2023

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.33751/jhss.v7i3.8083>

**Abstract.** Peat restoration is a government strategic program which is a top priority area, especially for Riau Province. Peat restoration is also one of the pilot projects that must be handled correctly, quickly and thoroughly so that it does not repeat the wounds of the disaster like 7 years ago. This is because, as the owner of the largest peatland in Sumatra, history has also been categorized as the biggest source of forest and land fires. It was suspected that the restoration of the peat was originally due to forest and peatland fires, so that the World Bank once estimated that the economic loss from the karhutla disaster reached Rp. 221 Trillion (Mileva et al. 2016). In accordance with Presidential Decree No. 1 of 2016, the government established the Peat Restoration Agency which is the leader in implementing peat restoration in Indonesia (Lebaran et al. 2016). It should be known that peat restoration is indeed designed within the framework of collaboration with many elites (representative groups that are considered capable), namely the Government, communities, NGOs and the private sector, which are the key elites for the implementation of peat restoration (collaborative governance). The elite approach strategy is the focus of this study by using collaborative governance theory as the main research framework. This study uses a qualitative method with a case study approach assisted by literature studies. Researchers found that there was a failure of peat restoration management strategy in Riau. The unclear status of the Regional Peat Restoration Team (TRGD) and the inactivity of the Riau Provincial Government in supporting the peat restoration agenda became the findings of this study. Researchers see there are several factors that cause it to happen. Economic factors become the main ones because peat restoration is related to investments in forestry and oil palm plantations. Then the cause of the failure of the management strategy, namely failure to understand communication between elites, was also caused by a lack of commitment from elite leaders in Riau.

**Keywords:** strategy; management; elite communication; peat restoration

### I. INTRODUCTION

This research is based on the researcher's interest in finding out more about peat management strategies in Indonesia, considering that Indonesia is ranked 4th for the largest peatland in the world, which is around 14.9 million hectares. (Lembaran et al. 2016). Efforts to restore peatlands have of course been around for a long time, but the issue has only intensified in recent years since the forest and land fires that made Indonesia known to the world as a smoke exporting country, recorded in 2015, total forest and land burned, 33 % of it is in peatlands (Atmojo and Gambut n.d.). Peatlands that are not utilized and not maintained in public monitoring, especially those that are already dry and damaged, will burn more easily. This burning peat releases an incredible amount of smoke and carbon into the air and is carried away freely by the wind, this smoke is very harmful to human health which will have an impact on the next decades for the next generation of descendants whose children are still babies today, toddlers and children even still in the womb. The World Bank estimates the impact of the loss is Rp. 221 trillion in which the fire event took 3 months (Mileva et al. 2016). Peat restoration is one of the Indonesian government's concrete efforts to contribute to protecting the world's climate. So, this is the basis for the

researcher's interest in conducting this research. Moreover, it is recorded that 7 provinces in Indonesia are the main priority areas for Peat Restoration, one of which is Riau Province.

The issue of peat is global and according to regulations it is a priority program, but in fact, the issue of peat itself in Riau province has not become a priority either for regional heads or at the provincial level. It would be very, very worrying, if you remember and consider the commitment of the regional government (pemda) which is none other than the key to the success of the management targets of managing the national peat restoration program. Apart from that, the researchers also found that this is none other than the pragmatism of the people's mindset, which makes the people themselves, even though they live in priority areas for peat restoration, they tend not to prioritize peat protection too much, but these people think that economic growth is and infrastructure development is a more important issue regardless of the weaknesses, in fact it is the strengths or advantages that they must pay attention to.

The description above makes researchers look at things that can be followed up or immediately executed to encourage the mainstreaming of peat issues in strategic fields or sectors so that long-term sustainability occurs in this natural resources protection program. The follow-up that will be reviewed is how

the actual strategy used? to what extent has the socialization of the importance of peat increased to the community?, how has the coordination increased in terms of relations, in other words, communication relations between the central government (central) and the regions?, to what extent has this been integrated with regional priorities?, and how is the existing law enforced? and the extent to which these elites collaborate to unite to complete the achievement of the goals of this Peat Restoration (RG). The protection and implementation of the peat restoration program is a national program that involves various parties at various levels of government. Implementation of the implementation of the restoration program in these 7 priority provinces, especially Riau, is the role of the regional government, and the Provincial Government cannot be ruled out either. Presidential Regulation (Perpres) No. 1 of 2016 concerning the Peat Restoration Agency (BRG) has emphasized the importance of cross-agency coordination. In this research, researchers gave names or designations to the institutions involved in peat restoration as multi-elite designations that coordinate communication. multi-elite, in the implementation of this national program. Specifically, Article 22 of this Presidential Regulation states that 'Every element within the Peat Restoration Agency (BRG) in carrying out their duties must apply the principle of multi-elite coordination, which focuses on integrated, synchronized relations between elite levels both within the BRG environment and in relations between elite government agencies both central and local. Further to Article 14, this Presidential Decree also emphasizes the important role of regional and provincial governments, especially governors, who have the authority to appoint officials as coordinators of the Regional Peat Restoration Team (Lembaran et al. 2016).

Apart from the Perpres, other regulations also emphasize the important role of the government in peat restoration, such as regulations issued by ministries and BRG. Government assignments for restoration activities are also contained in Minister of Environment and Forestry Regulation No. 61 of 2017 concerning Assignments as Government Affairs in the Environment and Forestry Sector for Peat Restoration Activities for Fiscal Year 2018 To 7 Governors in Indonesia, one of which is the Governor of Riau As a researcher who usually researches in the field of social sciences, of course, research on peat will only be carried out based on studies involving matters that are outside the usual context in natural sciences, especially forestry. It is at this point that it is urgent for researchers to find out more about peat restoration programs that are or have been running for a long time. As a researcher who usually deals with the study of "social" aspects, this time the researcher is trying to focus on the peat restoration elite on how the collaboration is built whether each element involved plays an active role in accordance with BRG's vision and mission, or instead there is without the notion of the term shadow state that makes BRG collaboratively move forward not backwards not so there is a high probability it will ambiguity occurs collaboratively between institutions. BRG as a new institution as a new leader certainly does not work alone. BRG in the process of implementing its program will certainly be related to various other institutional elites that already

existed. Then came the idea of the researcher to look at the strategy for the existing peat restoration process using a relationship lens or as summarized by the author from the perspective of "Relationship of Collaborative Governance".

The concept of Relationship of Collaborative Governance is a concept that emerged from the concept of governance which was strengthened after democracy became a governance commonly used in many countries in the world. The concept of governance emerges as a concept that emphasizes the role of multi-elite. The concept of governance seems to reduce the domination of the state which is too strong. Public administration studies then shifted towards collaborative studies (Wardani 2022), also found in the administrative journal Nasrulhaq (Negara and Makassar 2020).

If you look at the history of the emergence of the concept of governance, it started with the existence of economic liberalization that occurred in the United States and England which then gave rise to a governance virus that spread throughout the world.(37653-EN-liberalisasi-di-inggris-1970-1990.pdf n.d.). Then the most recent where governance was greatly strengthened was when the Washington Consensus emerged from the 1989 World Bank report whose main point was the widest possible involvement of non-state actors and limiting government intervention (Malang n.d.) and (Wicaksono 2019) who explained the Collaborative Governance Concept, in fact, is a concept that describes multi-actor collaboration which I call in this study "elite" who have the same goal preferences. The essence is that there are state and non-state elites (private and public) who have similar concerns who then join in collaborating so that public issues can be properly resolved. This concept has also become a common strategy in the public administration literature (Jin & Yoo, 2012).

There are several reasons why researchers use the concept of collaborative governance, namely as a review of the strategy applied in carrying out the restoration mission: Increased awareness, Ability, The active role of the community, Civil society groups, Business world, Government, Local government and Village government in managing sustainable peatlands'. The commitment to involve the provincial and regional governments is also very important given the high probability of peatland fires occurring again in Indonesia, both due to weather factors and due to human destruction. Proactive actions at the regional level will increase the effectiveness of efforts to prevent and anticipate fires which have massive economic and public health impacts. The researcher also used the public choice theory to help researchers find the factors that led to the failure or success of the existing peat restoration program in Riau Province. In the science of public administration, the study of political economy has a very strategic position, political economy is closely related to public policy starting from the process of planning, formulation, system, organization and at the stage of implementation of public policy (Rachbini, 1996) in a journal (Wicaksono 2019). In political economy, public choice theory is one of the most commonly used theories to analyze various cases. In political economy, public choice theory is one of the most commonly used theories to analyze various cases. So,

actually public choice theory can be used to analyze the behavior of elites in government broadly (politicians, bureaucrats, political parties, etc.) Operationally in this study, researchers use public choice as a perspective that can explain the factors that lead to the success or failure of inter-elite collaboration on peat restoration in Riau (Gamut Restoration as a policy, Elite attitudes welcome it as a decision as well as the relationship or relationship of the policy).

Furthermore, it was also explained that in the midst of the incessant Citaker law in recent decades, new polemics have emerged as demands public administration reform thus making a big question also with the recent issues related to the development scale process. There is Power within power regardless of the legitimacy of power, there are Rules within the rules which also regardless of the legitimacy of the applicable rules, control beyond the limits of legitimacy, so that there tends to be or often happens cheating and produces unilateral policies regardless of the *das sein* the rules should be and the reality that happens *das sollen* which is not in accordance with expectations in the environment. This is what is called the shadow state. Relevant to what was explained by William Reno: 2019 in the African political dictionary book mentions a system of government in which a parallel form of government is established by a coalition of domestic leaders, local intermediaries, and foreign companies, in such a way that the formal apparatus of the state is not in the actual place of power. The shadow state is characterized by the presence of private armies, the corrupt distribution of state contracts, and the centrality of private private networks.

## II. RESEARCH METHODS

The method used is a case study which is included in the qualitative research group. Qualitative research is a method commonly used by researchers based on social sciences to understand social phenomena. This method will provide sufficiently detailed results of each impact (W and Kunyanti 2021). In line with that qualitative research is research that aims to explore and understand the meaning in a number of individuals or groups of people originating from social problems, Airlangga University e-library (Pustaka 2016), Meanwhile, the important variables are determined by the researcher to determine them all (Sarantakos, 1993) in (Wicaksono 2019). Peat restoration combined with the Collaborative Governance concept is suitable for exploration using the case study method. This research focuses on discussing peat restoration that is taking place in Riau Province, making this research focused, detailed and in-depth at only one location. Apart from being able to focus on one location, the case study method can also make this research focus on exploring the process of collaboration between elites in this restoration and combined with literature studies so that the results of research with the same study can be analyzed as to what relationship or how elite communication can be running smoothly in the implementation of the peat restoration program as a strategy or way out of communication problems in collaboration, on this basis, researchers think that this method is appropriate to use in this study.

## III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Restoration of the discussion and research results according to BRG's mission reference, namely by referring to 3 strategies called the 3R strategy. The first is Rewetting, the second is Revegetation, and the third is Revitalization. Restoration of peatlands certainly cannot just happen. Appropriate steps are needed to arrive at good peatland conditions. Looking at the 3R strategy, peatland restoration certainly cannot just go away. Appropriate steps are needed to arrive at good peatland conditions. The first wetting strategy, namely the peat in the Rewetting strategy, is needed to restore its moisture. Peatlands that are already dry and damaged due to the action of man-made canals, so that peatlands return to an ideal moisture level, water management is needed by building canal blocking, back filling, drilled wells, and / or water retaining function to store water in rivers or canals. So that the water in the peat land is restrained and does not come out. Then proceed with the second R strategy, when it is moist again, the peat land can be replanted which is called Revegetation with plants that do not disturb the water cycle in the peat ecosystem. The vegetation process will maintain the sustainability of the peat ecosystem and also strengthen canal blocking, as well as protect peatlands from being eroded by canal water flow. Plants that can be planted and have economic value are planting sago, rubber, coffee and coconut or promoting fisheries and nature tourism.

The final stage in peat restoration is the economic empowerment of the surrounding community, namely the third R strategy (Economic revitalization). Peatland restoration does not only stop at ecological restoration and revegetation, but also has to think about empowering the local community living around its peat base. Socialization and training on planting plants on peatlands. In fact, economic opportunities in the field of fisheries and ecotourism are also touched upon. This series of 3R program strategies is a series that cannot be separated from one unit. Peat restoration can restore the conditions or characteristics of the peat ecosystem, particularly its ability to absorb or store water up to 13 times its volume and the abundance of unique flora and fauna species. Restoration efforts are continuing to reduce the rate of peat damage. Riau Province's peat restoration target is spread across protected and cultivated areas. Riau Province also has a large hydrological area and based on data from the Ministry of Environment and Forestry, the damage to the Riau province's peat ecosystems has reached approximately 4,969,174 ha of its total area of 5,355,374 ha. Therefore, not only the 3R of the management strategy is needed, but also the proper hydrological management is needed, with the environmental conditions of the peat in the category from the level of mild damage to the next level of severe damage, from the management of the process of managing restoration coordination which is communication in a collaborative governance relationship. It needs to be reviewed as an effort to increase the progress of its management strategy. The following is a mapping of ongoing elite collaboration in the peat restoration management program in Riau Province.

The first mapping traced from Elite Peat Restoration Agency (Elit BRG) actors performs: Performs the role of



coordinator of the peat restoration program, Performs the role of primary data provider regarding the areas to be restored, Performs the role of executor of direct restoration independently or in collaboration with elites from another agency. The description of the three roles carried out by the BRG elite operates in the Riau province region which is spread across regencies such as; Regency. Meranti Islands, Kab. Siak, Kab. Bengkalis, Kab. Pelalawan, District, Rokan Hilir. Regency. Rokan Hulu, Kab. Indragiri Hilir and Kab. Indragiri Hulu, Kab. Camphor, City. Dumai, and Pekanbaru City. The results of the second mapping traced from the elite actors from the Riau Province Environment and Forestry Service performing their role as elite Regional Technical Institutions authorized in the forestry sector, which has a Peat Restoration Section which was newly formed in early 2017, Still involved passively in implementing peat restoration in Riau (planning and budgeting for peat restoration is not much).

The third mapping continuation, Elit from Jikalahari, which researchers traced, has played an active role in peat restoration since the early 2000s. This elite is also an elite environmental NGO who is quite "fierce" to fight for peat restoration, especially in Riau province, and also performs the role of peat restoration, both technically making canal blockings and assisting the community directly, which until now has remained continuous and focused on the Giam Peat Hydrological Unit. Siak Kecil to process the right restoration strategy. The results of the fourth mapping traced from WALHI elite actors where researchers traced that this Walhi has played an important role in peat restoration for a long time, carrying out programs technically, namely from canal blocking to community economic assistance, starting from dissemination of the types of flora and fauna that are suitable for planting land peat to the consideration of flora and fauna that can be empowered in improving the economy. Walhi researchers' search has been successful with a focus on the location of the Tohor River, Kab. Meranti Islands. Currently working in Kab. Siak, Kab. Pelalawan, Kab. Indragiri Hilir and Kab. Bengkalis.

The next elite, according to the mapping carried out by researchers, is the JMGR elite, the elite who were met and focused on the field of restoration of peat forests by granting village forest status, where this elite also plays a role in assisting the economic development of communities around peatlands, this elite has successfully fought for the status village forest (which is on peatland) to Rawa Mekar Jaya Village in Kab. Siak, don't forget that other regions are following suit, and don't forget to also do community advocacy. Other elites who carry out the restoration role are Elites from the Belantara Foundation. The focus is not only on restoring peatlands, but on the ecosystem as a whole. Even though the mission is the same, that is, they both aim at how the management of Riau's peat returns to normal and recovers from being damaged to being reorganized, Elite from this foundation works more alone in carrying out peat restoration with its operational area, namely Kab. Siak and Kab. Bengkalis.

The next elite is Elite from WWF Indonesia where this elite helps peat restoration according to the MOU with BRG covering an area of 200 thousand hectares with its operational area in collaboration with the Giam Siak Kecil-Sungai Rokan

Peat Hydrological Unit, which is still in the category of implementing the stages of the restoration program which adjusts the function and hydrological pressure on management stages. Finally, the elite whose role is quite awaited is the elite from the Riau University Disaster Study Center, who always provide precise technical direction in implementing peat restoration, where this elite is an institution that also focuses on studying peat research and peat restoration, whose operational area is covered by the peat throughout Riau Province.

Research studies from case studies and literature studies studied by researchers, namely elite actors who collaborate in the implementation of communication relationships on the peat restoration agenda in Riau, are said to be semi-partial peat restoration. This is because the elites in peat restoration are not integrated with positions and positions at a level that do not need each other, but are not completely partial. So, various elite actors are indeed indirectly connected to become BRG partners in the restoration agenda because they share the same vision, namely saving the environment through peat restoration. not with funding from BRG or the government. The majority of funds used by these NGOs come from various donor agencies. This means that BRG's presence here is a frame or symbol but also a positive platform that seems to be triggering the acceleration of the government's peat restoration agenda. BRG's presence is certainly very positive and is very well received by environmental activists who are focused on saving peat.

#### IV. CONCLUSION

It can be concluded that the management of the implementation of the Peat Restoration program has been flawed. The flaw in the management of peat restoration is due to the absence of a significant role from the Government, especially Riau Province, to actively participate in the peat restoration agenda. Participating actively here is not only formulating a strategy, compiling a group of related institutions collaboratively donating all kinds of things, but it should be, the government feels that it owns the wealth of this peat so that this sense of ownership will also make the synergy of all institutions work optimally without being lame like this. do not make and run each without knowing coordination between agencies, but by itself this attitude of ownership will flow to complete or optimize peat livelihoods in this Riau province. When you walk with a disability or are said to be lame, this of course brings out a negative stigma from the wider audience. Researchers at least analyze there are at least two main factors which are the reason for the lack of power of the Provincial Government to play an active role in the peat restoration agenda, there are other actors behind who control or steer outside of the mutual agreement within collaboration rules or what is called a shadow state because this is a provincial scope, the authors conclude as a shadow province as a child of the shadow state.

#### V. REFERENCES

- [1] "37653-EN-Liberalisasi-Di-Inggris-1970-1990.Pdf."

- [2] Atmojo, Dinar Tri, and Pantau Gambut. "Restorasi Gambut Dalam Pusaran Pilkada."
- [3] Lembaran, Tambahan, Negara Republik, Tambahan Lembaran, and Negara Republik. 2016. "No Title." : 1–16.
- [4] Malang, Universitas Negeri. "Aktor Non-Negara Dalam Hubungan Internasional." (5).
- [5] Mileva, Elitza et al. 2016. "Kerugian Dari Kebakaran Hutan."
- [6] Negara, Ilmu Administrasi, and Universitas Muhammadiyah Makassar. 2020. "Nilai Dasar Collaborative Governance Dalam Studi Kebijakan Publik." 6.
- [7] Pustaka, Daftar. 2016. "No Title." 16(2005): 2016–18.
- [8] W, R Willya Achmad, and Siti Anah Kunyanti. 2021. "Community Empowerment-Based Corporate Social Responsibility Program in Panglima Raja Village." 11(40): 12–19.
- [9] Wardani, Silvia Ayu. 2022. "Digital Repository Universitas Jember Digital Repository Universitas Jember."
- [10] Wicaksono, Agung. 2019. "Kolaborasi Multi Aktor Dalam Program Restorasi Gambut Di Provinsi Riau Memaparkan Mengenai Kolaborasi Multi Aktor Yang Memiliki Preferensi Tujuan Yang Sama ." : 111–25.