

THE INFLUENCE OF COMPETENCE, MOTIVATION AND CAREER DEVELOPMENT ON NURSE PERFORMANCE MEDIATED BY ORGANIZATIONAL COMMITMENT AT DR.TC.HILLERS MAUMERE REGIONAL GENERAL HOSPITAL

Yuliana Onang ^{ab*)}, Djawoto ^{b)}, Prijati^{b)}

^{a)} Universitas Nusa Nipa, Sikka, Indonesia

^{b)} Sekolah Tinggi Ilmu Ekonomi Indonesia, Surabaya, Indonesia

^{*)}Corresponding Author: yulianaonangdalopez@gmail.com

Article history: received 09 May 2023; revised 18 June 2023; accepted 08 July 2023

DOI:<https://doi.org/10.33751/jhss.v7i2.7534>

Abstract. This study aims to determine the influence of competence, motivation and career development on nurse performance mediated by organizational commitment at Regional General Hospital dr. TC. Hillers Maumere. The purpose of the study was to analyze the influence of competence, motivation and career development on nurse performance mediated by organizational commitment at RSUD dr TC Hillers Maumere. The population in this study was all nurses with clinical nurse III qualifications totaling ninety-five people. The sampling technique used is purposive sampling. Data collection techniques using questionnaires. The data analysis techniques used are descriptive statistical analysis with SPSS software tools and inferential statistics using Smart PLS 3.0. The test results show that competence, motivation and career development have a positive and significant effect on nurse performance. However competence, motivation and career development mediated by organisational commitment showed both positive and insignificant influences on nurse performance

Keywords: competence; motivation; career; organizational commitment

I. INTRODUCTION

The hospital is the main facility and place of the center of health service delivery which has a major role in public health services. As one of the health service centers, hospitals are required to always provide the best service to people who use and utilize these health facilities. As an institution or health service organization, hospitals have broad and comprehensive functions, expert-intensive and capital-intensive, therefore hospitals must have superior resources, namely capital resources and experienced and professional human resources. Nurses as one of the human resources in the health sector in hospitals play an important role in hospital services and in an effort to achieve health development goals, this is because nurses are the largest number of personnel, and nurses as a professional group who work 24 hours in hospitals (Masita [1]). The performance of nursing staff has an important role in creating good health service quality, because nursing staff are the first and longest contact with patients, so that nurses are figures who can represent almost the entire image and appearance of the hospital (Sinaga [2]).

Improvement of health services can be done if accompanied by improved performance of nurses. According to Gibson [3], the individual performance of nurses is influenced by three variables, namely individual variables, organizational variables and psychological variables. Individual variables consist of abilities and competencies,

skills, knowledge, demographics and family background. Psychological variables consist of perception, attitude, motivation, personality and learning. Organizational variables consist of resources, rewards, workload, structure, supervision and leadership.

Regional General Hospital (RSUD) dr.T.C. Hillers Maumere is a class C hospital in Sikka Regency that serves the needs of the general public for public health services in Sikka district, as well as a regional referral center for Flores and Lembata regions. Since 2014 it has changed its status to a Regional Public Service Agency (BLUD) hospital. RSUD dr. TC. Hillers Maumere became the object of this study with the consideration that there is a connection with the hospital's vision, which is to become a hospital that is loved and proud of the community. This means that the people of Sikka and its surroundings feel ownership and participate in thinking about how to make the hospital the best from all aspects, both infrastructure, equipment and quality of health human resources who are professionals in their fields. Other factors that are also considered by researchers are the mission of the hospital, namely, first, improving the ability, ethics and professionalism of human resources in the hospital, which is related to the variables of competence and motivation, and second, organizing education, training and research integrated with services, related to career development variabel.

According to Rahmalia [4], factors that can affect employee performance are: employee appreciation, employee

satisfaction, employee behavior, leadership style, employee motivation, employee development and work environment. The competence, motivation and career development instilled by the hospital in nurses will greatly affect the seriousness of nurses in working. In addition to competence, motivation also has an important role in motivation that can encourage nurses to work hard. Azar and Shafiqhi [5] state that one reason for employee and organizational success is due to the presence of high motivation factors and the concept of motivation is used to explain the ability and opportunity to work. Motivation is a factor that leads more to behavior in organizations. In addition to competence and motivation, career development can also provide opportunities for nurses to develop careers according to the path and level in the organization. Career development was chosen as a research variable considering that career development is basically needed for private and government companies because career development is oriented towards future business challenges in facing competitors. Based on the above background, the researcher wants to review the relationship between variables with the title The Effect of Competence, Motivation and Career Development on Nurse Performance Mediated by Organizational Commitment (Study at Regional General Hospital dr. TC. Hillers Maumere). The purpose of the study was to analyze the influence of competence, motivation and career development on nurse performance mediated by organizational commitment at RSUD dr TC Hillers Maumere

II. RESEARCH METHODS

The type of research used is quantitative research with causal associative techniques. The population in this study was all nurses of Regional General Hospital dr. TC. Hillers numbered 262 people. This study used purposive sampling techniques, namely sampling techniques based on certain criteria or considerations. The selected participants are samples that are considered closer to the assessment of variables well. The criteria used in this study are as follows:

1. DIII education with a working period of more than 9 years
2. S1 + Ners education with a working period of more than 2 years.

Based on the above criteria, the sample used in this study is the entire population (nurses) at the dr. TC Regional General Hospital. Hillers Maumere with 95 clinical nurse III qualifications. Data Collection Techniques, In this study, the authors used two data sources, namely primary data and secondary data. Data collection techniques using questionnaires and documentation. Data analysis techniques in this study use descriptive statistics with the help of SPSS software and inferential statistical analysis with the help of Smart PLS software, where Partial Least Square (PLS) analysis is an equation model of Structural Equation Modeling (SEM) that is component- or variant-based. The reason for using SEM-PLS is because this study is a study whose variables cannot be measured directly and the number of variables is complex (Ibrahim, [6]).

III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The effect of competence on nurse performance

Competency is the ability to perform or complete a job or task based on skills and knowledge and supported by the work attitude required for the job. Nursing competence must include elements of the ability to serve safely and comfortably, protect the community, and maintain the credibility of nurses. Certain competencies are identified by existing roles or knowledge, skills and attitudes demonstrated by their performance against certain criteria or standards. Basically, the work activity of nurses in hospital services emphasizes what appears or arises from work activities (results). In nursing work, patients are treated with the thought of saving the patient's life. Because performance includes components of product competence and productivity, performance results are highly dependent on the ability of individuals to achieve goals that have been set based on nursing work (Nursalam & Efendi [7]).

The performance of nurses is also considered good as an implication of good knowledge, skills and attitudes of employees. The reflection is that employees always achieve good quality work results, complete tasks according to work volume, use facilities/facilities, be on time in completing tasks/work according to the standards set by the leadership, never violate the procedures for carrying out the assigned tasks/work, and never get a leadership reprimand for late completion of tasks (Chotimah [8]). The results of this study prove that goal setting theory or Goal Setting Theory applies or can be applied to the object of research, namely hospitals, where goal setting theory shows a relationship between performance goals and tasks. According to goal setting theory, individuals have several goals, choose goals, and they are motivated to achieve these goals (Srimindarti [9]). This theory assumes that the main factor influencing the choices individuals make is the goals they have. Goal setting theory has shown a significant influence in goal formulation (Arsanti [10]). This theory explains the factors that affect nurse performance, one of which is related to aspects of nurse competence. The application of goal setting theory in this study is related to the competence of nurses, because if the competence of a nurse is high, it becomes an added value for hospitals in producing maximum output so that it makes it easier for organizations to achieve goals. Goal setting theory also explains the relationship between goals and performance. The right goals can be determined by individuals who have competence. The results of this study also support the research conducted by Chotimah [8] at RSUD dr. Abdoer Rahem Situbondo Regency which states that competence has a positive and significant effect on nurses' performance. However, this study is not in line with research conducted by Rosyita [11] which states that competence does not have a significant effect on nurse performance.

The effect of motivation on nurse performance

Motivation is a condition that leads employees to achieve organizational goals (work goals). Good work motivation has a significant influence on member

performance. The reason is strong motivation, which can encourage a new passion for work among employees. Employee performance increases when the motivation provided is in accordance with employee needs. This is in line with the encouragement of nurses at Dr.TC Hillers Maumere Hospital. Motivation is a conscious effort to influence one's behavior in order to work towards achieving a particular outcome or goal. Work motivation is a factor that encourages and influences employees to raise their morale and create better work behavior in their work to achieve goals (Wijayanti [12]). Motivation empowers employees to work harder. The results of this study strengthen the theory of goal setting or Goal setting theory and can be applied to the object of research, namely hospitals. Goal setting theory is a form of motivation theory. The basic concept of this theory is that a person who understands the goals (what the organization expects him) will affect his work behavior. According to this theory, one of the commonly observed characteristics of behavior is that it continues until it reaches completion. Once a person starts something (such as a job, a new project), he will keep pressing until the goal is achieved. The theory also states that individual behavior is governed by one's ideas (thoughts) and intentions. Goals can be viewed as goals or work levels that individuals want to achieve. Goal setting theory implies that an individual is committed to a goal. If an individual is committed to achieving his goals, then this will affect his actions and affect the consequences of his performance.

Goal-setting theory also talks about the effect of goal setting, challenges, and feedback on performance. This theory departs from the intention to work to achieve a goal that is the main source of work motivation. That is, these goals tell workers what to do and how much effort to exert. The results of this study support research conducted by Karjono [13] which shows that motivation has a significant effect on nurses' performance. But this study is not in line with Kaengke [14], who showed that motivation has no significant effect on nurse performance.

The effect of career development on nurse performance:

Career development is the process of increasing work ability that encourages increased work performance to achieve the desired career. The company supports career activities, therefore the company expects feedback from employees in the form of work performance. Work performance is the work product that employees achieve in accordance with company standards. Work efficiency increases benefits for the company and employees. One of the benefits for employees is that they can expand career experience while working, while the benefits for organizations are to facilitate decision making (Wahyuni, [15]).

Broadly speaking, employee career development has a positive impact indirectly on the organization. Employees can prepare for the career path they want to achieve and assist in career decisions. Career development systems can assist employees as well as managers in making career decisions. Furthermore, employees get the opportunity to assess their

skills and competencies and know their future goals and aspirations so that employees can prepare themselves for the career path they want to achieve. Another benefit of career development is better use of employee skills; Employees understand themselves more, employee participation increases, guarantees welfare and increases self-confidence [16]. The results of this study are in line with the theory of goal setting or Goal setting theory, which can be applied to the object of research, namely hospitals where goal setting at work is to help in achieving success in career. Goal setting is a good way to help nurses choose a career path and make it easier to concentrate on important tasks. Goal setting theory implies that an individual is committed based on goals; if an individual is committed to achieving his goals, including career development, then this will affect his actions so that it will affect his performance. According to goal setting theory, individuals have several goals, choose goals, and they are motivated to achieve these goals (Srimindarti [9]). This theory assumes that the main factor influencing the choices individuals make is the goals they have. Goal setting theory has shown a significant influence in goal formulation (Arsanti [10]). The results of this study support research conducted by Putra [17] which shows that Career Development has a positive and significant effect on nurses' performance. However, this study is not in line with Katidjan [18] which shows that career development has no significant effect on nurses' performance.

The influence of competence on nurse performance through organizational commitment

The results showed that organizational commitment could not mediate the effect of competence on nurse performance because the nilap P value was greater than 0.05. This condition can occur because in hospital services nurses who have competence will work to provide good service and show good work performance despite the lack of organizational commitment. The nurses at RSUD dr. TC Hillers Maumere was called and truly realized that their job was to minister to the sick and helpless. The services they provide are excellent services with a form of humanity, so that without any organizational commitment, the nurses will continue to work by showing good performance. According to goal setting theory, individuals have several goals, choose goals, and they are motivated to achieve these goals (Srimindarti [9]). This theory assumes that the main factor influencing the choices individuals make is the goals they have. Goal setting theory has shown a significant influence in goal formulation (Arsanti [10]). The results showed that goal setting theory does not apply or cannot be applied to the object of research, namely hospitals if they place organizational commitment as a mediating variable between the competence and performance of nurses. TC Hillers Maumere lacks commitment within the organization to develop nurse competence because hospitals lack funds to finance education and training for nurses. The current condition is that nurses try alone to finance education and training to improve their competence as a nurse in facing the demands of the profession.

Based on the previous discussion, the competencies possessed by PK III nurses at RSUD dr. TC Hillers Maumere belongs to the high category. This is in accordance with the conditions in the field that the hospital always strives to increase competence for nurses which is useful for improving the performance of nurses, especially PK III nurses. However, with the competencies provided, nurses are still unable to increase the organizational commitment of nurses. This is because the nurses feel they have to stay working in the hospital because they are bound by their status as State Civil Apparatus (ASN) and the nurse oath they have done. This is because there are other factors that are felt to be able to influence the commitment of nurse organizations to hospitals. Therefore, from this discussion, it can be concluded that organizational commitment cannot be a mediating variable or intermediary for competence in nurse performance at RSUD dr. TC Hillers Maumere. This is because nurses are health workers who have taken the oath of profession and they are well aware of their duty of service to the sick and suffering so that the high and low commitment of their organization will not be able to affect its performance. This is in line with research conducted by Bagyo [19] which says that organizational commitment cannot mediate the influence of competence on nurse performance.

The influence of motivation on nurse performance through organizational commitment

Results suggest that organizational commitment cannot mediate the influence of motivation on nurse performance. This is unique because the results of research show that motivation has a significant effect on nurse performance, but when organizational commitment mediates the relationship of motivation to nurse performance becomes insignificant. Goal-setting theory talks about the effect of goal setting, challenges, and feedback on performance and asserts that to work toward a goal is the main source of work motivation. That is, these goals tell workers what to do and how much effort to exert. The results showed that goal setting theory does not apply or cannot be applied to the object of research, namely hospitals if they place organizational commitment as a mediating variable between motivation and nurse performance. This is caused because of the conditions that occur in RS dr. TC Hillers Maumere lacks commitment in the organization to provide motivation to nurses in the form of appreciation for achievement, incentives in the form of nurse services that are always late and even delinquent for up to one year, nurses are less given the opportunity to develop their potential and less given the opportunity to try to improve the skills of the nursing profession. The relationship of organizational commitment conveys the influence of work motivation on employee performance can be explained, work motivation is a person's motivation to do certain work, while the spirit of organizational commitment arises when the motivation given can really provide a clear encouragement for employees, Employees who already have strong motivation and commitment to the organization or company and strive to improve their performance as a sign of dedication against the company. However, based on the results of distributing

questionnaires as well as direct interviews with PK III nurses, said that PK III nurses at RSUD dr. TC Hillers Maumere already has good work motivation so that even without the spirit of organizational commitment, the nurses are very enthusiastic and loyal to the hospital, so they will improve their performance again with the aim of wanting a career as well as wanting to express new ideas for the progress of the hospital.

Based on the previous discussion, the motivation given by RSUD dr. TC Hillers Maumere to nurses belongs to the high category. This is in accordance with the conditions in the field that the hospital always provides useful motivation to improve the performance of nurses, especially PK III nurses. However, the motivation given is still not considered able to increase the organizational commitment of nurses. This is because the nurses feel they have to stay working in the hospital because they are bound by their status as State Civil Apparatus (ASN) and the nurse oath they have done. This is because there are other factors that are felt to be able to influence the commitment of nurse organizations to hospitals. So from the discussion above, it can be concluded that organizational commitment cannot be an intervening variable or intermediary for work motivation for nurse performance at RSUD dr. TC Hillers Maumere. This is because nurses are health workers who have taken the oath of profession and they are well aware of their duty of service to the sick and suffering so that the high and low commitment of their organization will not be able to affect its performance. This is in line with research conducted by Ghozali [20] which says that organizational commitment cannot mediate the influence of motivation on nurse performance.

The influence of career development on nurse performance through organizational commitment

These results suggest that organizational commitment cannot mediate the influence of career development on nurses' performance. This is unique because research shows that career development has a significant effect on nurses' performance, but when organizational commitment mediates the motivational relationship to nurses' performance becomes insignificant. Employee attachment refers to the extent to which employees are fully engaged in work and their commitment to work and the company (Noe [21]). Therefore, well-managed career development will result in high work attachment, so that employee performance is more optimal and beneficial for the company to achieve company goals. By paying attention to employee career development, it is expected that their performance will be optimal. In addition to the fact that commitment affects career development and employee performance, the role of commitment as a facilitator of career development also affects employee performance. By paying attention to employee career development, it is hoped that employee performance results can be optimal. As stated by Sedarmayanti [22], employee performance is a description of performance related to the work of an employee, management processes, or the organization as a whole, where the results of the work must be shown with concrete and measurable evidence (against

specified standards). Career development plays an important role in increasing employee engagement to achieve specific goals. Employee participation refers to the extent to which employees are fully engaged in work and their commitment to work and the company (Noe [21]). Therefore, well-managed career development will result in high work attachment, so that employee performance is more optimal and the company benefits from achieving company goals.

Goal setting is a good way to help nurses choose a career path and make it easier to concentrate on important tasks. Goal setting theory implies that an individual is committed based on goals; if an individual is committed to achieving his goals, including career development, then this will affect his actions so that it will affect his performance. The results showed that goal setting theory does not apply or cannot be applied to the object of research, namely hospitals if they place organizational commitment as a mediating variable between career development and nurse performance. This is because RS dr. TC Hillers Maumere lacks commitment within the organization to develop nursing careers because the hospital lacks funds to finance training, follow further education and competency courses to improve themselves. In addition, hospitals do not provide space to occupy several positions in accordance with the competence of nurses, but because it is more for political office considerations. At RSUD dr. TC Hillers Maumere, organizational commitment cannot play a mediating role. This condition occurs because nurses are health workers who have carried out the oath of profession and they are well aware of their duty of service to the sick and suffering so that the high and low commitment of their organization will not be able to affect their performance. This is in line with research conducted by Silaban [23] which says that organizational commitment cannot mediate the influence of career development on nurses' performance.

IV. CONCLUSION

From the results and discussion above, it can be concluded that the legal aid institution (LAI) has a strategic role in assisting individuals or groups in the form of business entities or other organizations in solving legal problems faced. LAI can provide professional assistance in resolving brand disputes, so that the settlement process can be easier. In the event of a trademark dispute, LAI can provide advocacy and assistance in the settlement process, including in the case of lawsuits or out-of-court settlements. Thus, LAI can ensure that the rights of parties involved in trademark disputes are protected and fulfilled in a professional manner and in accordance with applicable law. In various cases, especially brand disputes, legal aid institutions or abbreviated as LAI have roles, among others: a. Recruiting advocates, paralegals, lecturers, and law faculty students. b. Perform Legal aid services. c. Organizing legal counseling, legal consultation, and other activity programs related to the implementation of Legal Aid. d. Receive a budget from the state to carry out legal assistance under this Law. e. Issue opinions or statements in

defending cases that are their responsibility in court hearings in accordance with the provisions of laws and regulations. f. Obtain information and other data from the government or other agencies, for the purpose of case defense. 7. Obtain guarantees of legal protection, security, and safety while providing legal assistance.

REFERENCES

- [1] Masita, A., N. Yuniar dan I. Lisnawaty. 2016. Faktor-Faktor yang Berhubungan dengan Pemanfaatan Pelayanan Kesehatan pada Masyarakat Desa Tanailandu di Wilayah Kerja Puskesmas Kanapa-Napa Kecamatan Mawasangka Kabupaten Buton Tengah Tahun 2015. Haluoleo University. 2017.
- [2] Sinaga, L.R.V., E. Sianturi., M. Maisyara., N. Amir., S.J.P. Imamora., A. Ashriady dan H. Hardiyati. Pendidikan Kesehatan dan Ilmu Perilaku, Yayasan Kita Menulis. 2021.
- [3] Gibson, J. *Fisiologi dan Anatomi Modern untuk Perawat*. EGC. 2002.
- [4] Rahmalia, D. Kepuasan Kompensasi Ekstrinsik dan Instrinsik Terhadap Intensi Keluar. *Jurnal Psikologi Kognisi*, 1, 1-11. 2017.
- [5] Azar, M. dan A.A. Shafighi. *The effect of work motivation on employees' job performance (Case study: employees of Isfahan Islamic Revolution Housing Foundation)*. *International journal of academic research in business and social sciences*, 3, 432. 2013.
- [6] Ibrahim J.T. *Metode Penelitian Sosial Ekonomi Pertanian*. Penerbit Universitas Muhamadiyah Malang. 2020.
- [7] Nursalam, N. dan F. Efendi. *Pendidikan dalam Keperawatan*. Salemba Medika. 2008.
- [8] Chotimah, C., M. A. Hermawati. Analisis Pengaruh Kompetensi dan Perencanaan Karir terhadap Kinerja Paramedis RSUD dr. Abdoer Rahem Kabupaten Situbondo. *JIM (Jurnal Ilmu Manajemen)*, 5, 1-14. 2020
- [9] Srimindarti. C. Faktor-faktor yang Mempengaruhi *Premature sign-of* dengan *Turnover Intention* sebagai *Variable Intervening* : Suatu Tinjauan dari Goal Setting theory. *Jurnal Organisasi dan Manajemen*, Vol.8, No.2,102-110. 2021.
- [10] Arsanti. T.A. Hubungan antara Penetapan Tujuan, *self-efficacy* dan Kinerja. *Jurnal Bisnis dan Ekonomi (JBE)*, Vol. 16, No.2 : Hal. 97 – 110. 2009.
- [11] Rosyita, H., D. Aditaruna. dan S. Sugiharto. Motivasi Kerja dan Kompetensi Profesional Terhadap Kinerja Perawat di Ruang Rawat Inap Bougenvil dan Seruni Rumah Sakit Umum Daerah Cibinong Bogor. *Jurnal Manajemen Kesehatan Yayasan RS. Dr. Soetomo*, 7, 78-89. 2021.
- [12] Wijayanti I.R., B. Satrijo dan W. A. Langgeng . Pengaruh terhadap Pengembangan Karier dan Motivasi terhadap Kepuasan Kerja Karyawan PT.INKA (Persero) Madiun. *Jurnal FIPA : Forum*

- Ilmiah Pendidikan Akuntansi*, Vol.5., No.1. 2017.
- [13] Karjono, M. Motivasi Kerja Memberikan Pengaruh Kuat Terhadap Kinerja Perawat di Rumah Sakit Biomedika Mataram. *Jurnal Sangkareang Mataram*, 6, 20-23. 2020.
- [14] Kaengke, A.S., B. Tewal dan Y. Uhing. Pengaruh Pengembangan Karier, Pelatihan dan Motivasi Terhadap Kinerja Karyawan pada Pt Air Manado. *Jurnal EMBA: Jurnal Riset Ekonomi, Manajemen, Bisnis Dan Akuntansi*, 6. 2018.
- [15] Wahyuni, S. Ana. Analisis Faktor-faktor yang Mempengaruhi Turnover Intention (Keinginan Berpindah) Karyawan pada Perusahaan Jasa Konstruksi. Tesis, Fakultas Teknik. Universitas Brawijaya. 2014.
- [16] Note HR. Pengembangan Karir Karyawan: Manfaat dan Penerapan. 2021. <https://id.hrnote.asia/orgdevelopment/pengembangan-karir-karyawan-250121>
- [17] Putra, P. Pengaruh Pengembangan Karier dan Budaya Organisasi Terhadap Kinerja Perawat Rumah Sakit Fatima Parepare. *Jema Adpertisi Journal*, 1, 25-35. 2020.
- [18] Katidjan, P.S., S. Pawirosumarto. dan A. Isnaryadi. Pengaruh Kompensasi, Pengembangan Karier dan Komunikasi terhadap Kinerja Karyawan. *MIX: Jurnal Ilmiah Manajemen*, 7, 224241. 2017.
- [19] Bagyo Y. dan R. Khusnia. Komitmen Organisasional Memediasi Pengaruh Kompetensi dan *Counterproductive Work Behavior* Terhadap Kinerja. *Ekonika : Jurnal Ekonomi Universitas Kadiri.*, Volume 6 Nomor 1, 2581-2157 . 2021.
- [20] Ghozali, Imam. “Aplikasi Analisis Multivariate dengan Program SPSS “. Semarang : UNDIP. 2009.
- [21] Noe, Raymond A., Hollenbeck, John R., Gerhart, Barry., & Wright, Patrick M. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia: Mencapai Keunggulan Bersaing.* (Edisi 6, Jilid 1). Jakarta:Salemba Empat. 2010.
- [22] Sedarmayanti. *Sumber Daya Manusia dan Produktivitas Kerja.* Bandung: Mandar Maju. 2011
- [23] Silaban, R. L., A.W. Handaru dan A. Saptono. *Effect of Workload, Competency, and Career Development on Employee Performance with Organizational Commitment Intervening Variables.* *The International Journal of Social Sciences World (TIJOSSW)*, 3, 294-311. 2021.